



Enclosure 2a
November 9, 2016

Minutes of the Council on Postsecondary Education Meeting

**Postsecondary Education
SPECIAL MEETING AND RETREAT
Friday, September 23, 2016, 8:00 a.m.
W. Alton Jones Campus
University of Rhode Island
Whispering Pines Conference Center-Sycamore
401 Victory Highway
West Greenwich, Rhode Island 02817**

The Council on Postsecondary Education met on Friday, September 23, 2016, at the University of Rhode Island, W. Alton Jones Campus, Whispering Pines Conference Center, 401 Victory Highway, West Greenwich, Rhode Island. At 8:15 a.m. Chair William Foulkes welcomed everyone. He then asked for the roll to be taken, after which he declared a quorum present.

Present: Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam (arrived at 8:17 a.m.), Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator Thomas Izzo (arrived at 11:45 a.m.), John Rainone and Dr. Jeffrey Williams.

Absent:

1. ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA

Chair Foulkes entertained a motion to accept the agenda. On a motion duly made by Dr. Williams and seconded by Mr. Duffy, it was

VOTED: **THAT** The Council on Postsecondary Education accept the agenda for the meeting of September 23, 2016.

VOTE: 8 members voted in the affirmative and no members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green and Dr. Jeffery Williams.

NAYS: 0

ABSTAINS 0

2. DISCUSSION ITEMS

Governor Raimondo was also in attendance for the discussion session.

Presidents' Reports (includes institutional strategic plans and responses to the System Strategic Plan).

a) University of Rhode Island

President David Dooley gave a presentation on the Strategic Plans for the University of Rhode Island.

President Dooley reviewed the URI vision for creating a globally competitive institution, increasing enrollments, enhancing diversity, and preparing students for the 21st-century workforce. Currently, there are 16,613 students representing 67 nations and 42 states and territories, with the student body made up of 55% women and 19.5% students of color.

URI Strategic Academic Plan 2016-2021 Goals

1. Enhance Student Success
2. Expand Research, Scholarship and Creative Work
3. Grow a Global Presence
4. Embrace Diversity and Social Justice
5. Streamline Processes to Improve Effectiveness
6. Implement a Bold Advancement Agenda

Tuition and Fees FY 2017 Peer Institutions

Rhode Island ranks #5 for in-state and #7 for out-of-state tuition, as compared with New England peers. They have barely increased tuition and staff yet they have increased the number of students attending URI.

Critical Priorities for Capital Development and Asset Protection

The critical priorities are the Fine Arts Center, Fogarty Hall Infrastructure, White Horn Brook Apartments, Narragansett Bay Campus, and asset protection.

Future Opportunities and Programs

The future opportunities are at the George and Anne Ryan Institute for Neuroscience, International Studies, Foreign Policy and Diplomacy, Criminology and Criminal Justice, Data Science, Global reach and internationalization of students and faculty and research growth.

Resource Needs to Accomplish Goals

URI needs predictable and increasing state appropriations, autonomy for day-to-day management of operations, increasing capital projects investments, independence to assess market trends and set tuition levels accordingly.

A discussion regarding the issues raised in President Dooley's presentation then followed.

b) Rhode Island College

President Frank Sanchez gave a presentation on the Strategic Plans for Rhode Island College:

QUALITY:

RIC has the #1 RN to BSN Program in New England. RIC is the leading producer of teacher certifications in Rhode Island. They are also among the top 10 percent of the best Accounting Programs in the Northeast.

RIC is #1 among colleges addressing access, affordability and success in New England. They have 3 ½ times more external funding for research than other peer institutions nationally. RIC has the #4 Most Affordable Social Work Program in the Northeast.

LEARNING INNOVATION:

Students should be better prepared for the 21st-century workplace, and community partnerships and internships are important for improving competitiveness. RIC is looking into an experiential learning requirement for all graduates.

INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS:

RIC established a Workforce Planning Committee to analyze every vacancy and determine if the FTE might be better used for a different position.

The college bookstore was privatized. Now, instead of a net money loser, the college is guaranteed a minimum of \$150,000 annually in revenue. They are seeking a public-private partnership to fund a new residence hall. Also, the college is in the process of converting every light on campus to LED to reduce carbon footprint and yield a million in savings within 3 years. Class schedules have been revamped to be more effective and efficient. RIC is strengthening enrollment management through use of data analytics. They have the largest freshman class in years.

INCLUSIVE EXCELLENCE:

RIC is committed to inclusive excellence. They will hire an Associate Vice President of Community, Equity and Diversity, and establish a President's Commission on Inclusive Excellence. RIC is committed to recruiting and supporting diverse faculty and staff.

COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP:

RIC will build upon the Central Falls partnership to establish student supports, engage the school of social work, bolster adult education and create a national model teacher Prep program.

CHALLENGES:

RIC must address student success, stabilize enrollments and improve student learning.

RESOURCE NEEDS:

Per OPC data, RIC is funded 13% less than its national peers (\$13.2 M less based on FTE student count).

PRIORITY INVESTMENTS:

Four of six residence halls are in poor condition. \$25M in RICAP funds is needed over 5 years.

Advising needs to be professionalized into a hybrid professional/faculty model, expected to cost \$1.1M.

Faculty salaries need to be raised to regional average for recruitment and retention: \$6.7M. RIC faculty are paid lower than regional peers: Assistant Professor 12% less, Associate 11%, full professor 17%.

President Sanchez concluded by saying he wants to offer the best education in the country. He is open to bringing new thoughts to the table. A discussion regarding the issues raised in President's Sanchez's presentation then followed.

c) Community College of Rhode Island

President Meghan Hughes gave a presentation on the Strategic Plans for the Community College of Rhode Island.

President Hughes stressed the importance of getting a postsecondary education and how CCRI must be a bridge to deliver more graduates successfully to two places: a four-year college and quality employment. President Hughes invited her staff to speak to their areas of expertise.

Sara Enright, Chief Outcomes Officer and Vice President of Student Affairs and Dr. Rosemary Costigan, Interim Vice President of Academic Affairs gave the following updates:

ENROLLMENT:

The community colleges across the country are faced with declining enrollment. CCRI's enrollment has been declining over the past five years. With the economy improving in Rhode Island, people are focusing on jobs and holding off on pursuing higher

education. Also, there is a declining high school population nationally and locally. Finally, more students are pursuing degrees on line.

At CCRI, they are working aggressively to address very complex enrollment challenges with the goal of maintaining current enrollment. Their short term effort has been three-pronged: greater outreach, meeting students where they are, and simplifying the enrollment process.

PERSISTENCE:

CCRI is working on three initiatives to improve student persistence: master scheduling, guided pathways and developmental education pilots.

They are working on a Master Schedule that will greatly decrease course conflicts. They will be moving to the new schedule in January 2017, with a consistent set of time slots for course offerings, eliminating the many competing course formats they have today.

Guided Pathways group related majors together to provide students with clear structure and support in both choosing a pathway and pursuing the right coursework to finish. This approach is used by virtually all high-performing community colleges and many four-year schools as well.

Many students come to CCRI testing at a “below college-level “and are assigned to developmental math, English and/or reading courses. CCRI has undertaken two initiatives to tackle this challenge: multiple measures and co-requisite remediation.

Multiple measures involves taking a holistic view of student records, including previous coursework and test scores, with a view to placing them in the appropriate math and English courses at CCRI. The previous approach using Accuplacer often resulted in under placement.

Co-requisite remediation aims at having students complete the gateway courses sooner by enrolling students in the developmental and gateway courses concurrently.

TRANSFER:

Many CCRI students are unable to transfer all of their credits to a four-year institution. The ability to transfer credits is important because bachelor’s degree attainment is highly correlated with the percentage of credits that transfer.

CCRI is working in close collaboration with their partner schools, especially RIC and URI. They have collectively committed to improving transfer pathways. They need to make it simple and then make sure this information is in the hands of students, advisors and faculty.

CENTER FOR WORKFORCE AND COMMUNITY EDUCATION (CWCE):

CWCE has traditionally administered non-credit courses. Courses offered include CNA training, teacher's assistant training, etc. as well as a number of courses that are either mandated by the state (driver's education) or provided as a public service (GED classes and test administration). As part of the strategic re-organization, CCRI is exploring how CWCE will become better integrated with the college's for-credit offerings.

EQUITY:

Alphonso Atkins, Director, Institutional Equity and Title IX Coordinator, addressed the need to improve diversity at CCRI. CCRI has a very diverse student population. However, CCRI has minimal faculty diversity today. At other institutions, improving the diversity of the faculty has been shown to improve outcomes for students.

REDIRECT & INNOVATE:

Vice President for Business Affairs David Patten gave an overview of the strategic planning process. They are focused on student outcomes for high-demand, high-wage jobs. It is important to increase the online offerings and also offer new programs such as a new Cybersecurity degree.

A discussion regarding President Hughes' and the Vice Presidents' presentation then followed.

3. Commissioner Synthesis and Analysis

Before Commissioner Purcell gave his presentation, he invited Mr. Richard Culatta, Chief Innovation Officer for the State of Rhode Island, to give a brief overview of the Rhode Island Open Textbook Initiative that his office is spearheading. Announced by Governor Raimondo on September 27, 2016, the initiative aims to save college and university students over \$5 million over five years in the cost of textbooks by replacing traditional textbooks with openly licensed texts. A successful pilot program at Rhode Island College has already saved students over \$100,000 in textbook costs.

a) Brief Overview of Governance Changes over Time.

General Counsel Ron Cavallaro gave a summary of the changes in governance structures and functions for higher education in Rhode Island:

- Board of Governors for Higher Education
(Prior to January 2013)
- Rhode Island Board of Education
(January 2013 – June 30, 2014)
- Rhode Island Council on Postsecondary Education
(July 1, 2014 – present).

b) Reduced Functions: Audit/Academics/Budget/Oversight

Mr. Cavallaro summarized the functions of the Council on Postsecondary Education. Compared with previous governance structures, the Council's functions have been reduced in the areas of audit, academics, budget, and oversight. The audit function recently moved to the Department of Administration. In academics, the Council assesses whether proposed programs are within the role, scope, and mission of the institution, but does not do a full academic review. The Council continues to submit the budget for the system, subject to final approval from the Board, and cannot re-allocate funds among the institutions (a function that ceased in 2004 under the Board of Governors). Regarding oversight of the institutions, the Council coordinates the system strategic plan but does not have authority to intervene in internal operations (a limitation that has always been in place).

c) New Council Functions: Data Warehouse, Funding Formula, Performance, Learning Center, Student Aid and Assistance.

Mr. Cavallaro noted the new functions that the Council has assumed: maintaining and analyzing system-wide data in the data warehouse; submitting a funding formula with performance metrics; administering the Westerly Education Center; and taking on the student aid functions previously performed by RIHEAA (now the Division of Higher Education Assistance).

The General Counsel then answered questions from the members of the Council.

d) Moving Forward –Planning and Coordinating.

Commissioner Purcell gave an overview of planning and coordinating around the system-wide budgeting process:

National Trends

Commissioner Purcell gave a national overview of the educational appropriations per FTE and total education revenue per FTE, noting that Rhode Island lags behind in funding for higher education.

He then presented a plan for addressing underfunding and producing a system-wide funding formula with performance goals, as has been mandated by the legislature. He noted three goals for the process:

1. Give campuses a guide for moving forward.
2. Fund institutions comparable to their peers.
3. Implement a multi-year funding strategy.

An overview was given for peers for NCHEMS for URI, RIC and CCRI. All of the institutions that were listed have a similar Carnegie classification, similar mix of curriculum, and diverse enrollment.

URI is funded at 90% of its peers. Improving state support is important for the success of the state's flagship institution, but tuition, which is high vs their peers, should be closely monitored by the institution and Council.

RIC is funded at 86.75% of its peer average. Increases in tuition and state support are needed to provide RIC the funding needed to provide all of the resources of their peers.

In order to calculate CCRI's funding need, aspirational peers were used because of the CCRI's goal to provide more robust technical and vocational training. Compared with other community colleges that have a high output of technical degrees and certificates, CCRI is only funded at 81% of need. An additional \$17 million a year would be needed to support CCRI in fulfilling its workforce mission.

Overview of the budget requests

The early preliminary budget request from the campuses included a \$32,270,012 increase in funds.

- URI proposed a budget increase of \$ 21.6M.
- RIC proposed a budget increase of \$5.75M.
- CCRI requested a budget increase of \$4.9M.

Recommendations

Commissioner Purcell recommended addressing the system-wide underfunding through a combination of additional state appropriations, tuition/fee increases, self-funding through intentional refocusing over an extended period of time.

Intentional Refocusing

Commissioner Purcell gave some background on the concept of Intentional Refocusing:

- Institutions self-fund their priorities by purposely redirecting existing funds equivalent to their additional state support.
- Activity that businesses often do when budgeting and planning by analyzing their current product portfolio and consciously refocusing efforts on activities and investments that better position them for the future.
- Applied to government most notably in Georgia under Governor Zell Miller.
- Good for improving organizational efficiencies and effectiveness.

Funding Scenarios

Commissioner Purcell presented two scenarios that would establish a schedule of predictable, incremental funding increases for each institution to achieve parity with institutional their peers.

The first approach to addressing the shortfall was developed with input from the Department of Administration and sets a timeframe of five years with an annual effort toward addressing 20% of variance from peers, combined with a 1% increase in Tuition & Fees.

A second scenario for addressing the shortfall sets a timeframe of three years with an increase in tuition of 4%. Both scenarios recommend that the institutions implement Intentional Refocusing by redirecting existing funds equivalent to their new state support.

A discussion regarding the Commissioner's presentation then followed.

During the discussion, Governor Raimondo suggested that aspirational peers should be used for all three institutions with a view to making them more competitive.

Ms. Crosby expressed concern that the increase in state support for colleges will result in higher taxes.

Dr. Williams noted that the increases that are requested still do not reflect the institutions' real need.

Senator Izzo stated that the higher education office needs more staff in finance.

Governor Raimondo excused herself from the meeting and thanked everyone for attending the meeting especially the Council members and the college presidents.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

4a) Minutes of the Council on Postsecondary Education's July 27, 2016 Meeting.

On a motion duly made by Mr. Duffy and seconded by Ms. Crosby, it was

VOTED:	THAT	The Council on Postsecondary Education accept the minutes for the meeting of July 27, 2016 as proposed.
	VOTE:	9 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:
	YEAS:	Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator Thomas Izzo and Dr. Jeffery Williams.
	NAYS:	0
	ABSTAINS	0

4b) Minutes of the Council on Postsecondary Education's Special Meeting August 10, 2016.

On a motion duly made by Mr. DelGiudice and seconded by Ms. Crosby, it was

VOTED:	THAT	The Council on Postsecondary Education approve the minutes of the August 10, 2016 special meeting.
	VOTE:	9 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:
	YEAS:	Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator Thomas Izzo and Dr. Jeffery Williams.
	NAYS:	0
	ABSTAINS	0

5. Report from the Commissioner

Commissioner Purcell gave the following update:

a) Notice of Signature Authority from URI, RIC, and OPC.

Dr. Susan LaPanne reviewed the signature authorities from each college.

5b) Proposal from Rhode Island College for the Creation of a Certificate of Undergraduate Study in College and Career Attainment.

Rhode Island College (RIC) proposes to offer a Certificate in Undergraduate Study in College and Career Attainment through the Special Education Department in the Feinstein School of Education and Human Development. The Certificate will provide an inclusive college experience to students with intellectual disabilities who meet program admission requirements. RIC asserts that students will learn work readiness, employability and social skills and gain work experience by completing internships. It is the intent of the college to admit 10 students per year. Nationally, 249 colleges offer

opportunities for students with intellectual disabilities (ID) to take classes and participate in the campus community. Currently, no inclusive, broad-based transitions to postsecondary education programs are offered at colleges or universities in Rhode Island that meet U.S. Department of Justice requirements and are consistent with the U.S. Department of Education guidelines.

6. ACTION ITEMS

6a) Discussion and Recommendation for the Approval of Capital Improvement Plan for FY 2018-FY 2022 and Recommendation to the Board of Education.

Dr. Susan LaPanne provided an overview of the Capital Improvement Plan, which had been reviewed by the Finance and Facilities Committee.

She reported that the Council on Postsecondary Education was responsible for approximately 49% of all state property. The breakdown of stewardship by institution shows that URI has 32%, RIC has 13%, and CCRI has 4% while all other state property is 51%.

She noted that the funding sources used to support capital improvements are as follows:

- General Obligation Debt
- Rhode Island Health and Education Building Corporation Debt
- RICAP Funds
- Private Funds
- Third Party Funding
- University/College Funds

If the Council is going to create debt of any type for a project, it is necessary to apply to the Legislature for permission pursuant to the Public Corporation Debt Management Act. If the project is for an auxiliary area, that area must fund it and support its debt.

Dr. LaPanne also reminded the Council that both the Council and URI have their own bond ratings and that the bond rating for the Council has recently been upgraded to the URI level. All of the bonds are rated as high grade investments.

Components of the Capital Improvement Plan (CIP)

This report contains a five-year plan showing all projects, how they are funded, and whether they are ongoing or brand new for consideration.

There are 53 proposed projects on the total plan:

- 17 are already approved and in process
- 9 are current projects looking for continuation
- 14 are seeking approval for the 2017-2019 timeframe
- 13 are for consideration in the outer years 2020+

A discussion took place amongst the Council members regarding the use of land along the east side of Upper College Road (item #14 in the plan). Mr. Bernstein noted that as a member of the Finance/Facilities Committee, he voted to send the full CIP to the Council for discussion, but that he does not approve of URI's proposal to develop the land into a mixed-use facility that would include a hotel.

Dr. Williams asked how developing the land supports the university's mission.

President Dooley answered the mission is to facilitate students' success, and that building amenities enhances students' engagement and satisfaction. He also noted that URI has 50,000 visitors throughout the year and that having a mixed-use facility with a hotel would enhance the University's attractiveness to students and their families.

Mr. Duffy questioned what the CIP funds of \$50,000 would be used for in developing the Upper College Road land.

Ms. Crosby, Chair of the Finance/ Facilities Committee, clarified that approving the plan with this sum in item 14 would enable URI to conduct a broader feasibility study than those previously done to understand the full range of options available for developing the land on Upper College Road.

Following the discussion, Chair Foulkes called for a motion to approve the Capital Improvement Plan as presented, and a motion was then made by Mr. DelGiudice and seconded by Ms. Crosby.

Mr. Bernstein then moved to amend the Capital Improvement Plan to remove item 14, but the motion was not seconded and therefore did not proceed to a vote.

On the motion duly made by Mr. DelGiudice and seconded by Ms. Crosby, it was then

VOTED: THAT The Council on Postsecondary Education approve the Capital Improvement Plan for FY 2018-2022 as presented and forward it to the Board of Education for its approval and then submit the plan to the State Budget Office for review and inclusion in the Governor's recommended budget.

VOTE: 7 members voted in the affirmative, 0 members voted in the negative, and 2 abstained as follows:

YEAS: Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, and Senator Thomas Izzo

NAYS: 0

ABSTAINS: Michael Bernstein and Dr. Jeffery Williams

b) Approval of a Uniform Real Estate License Agreement, Licensor's Consent, Estoppel Certificate, Nondisturbance and Subordination Agreement between the Council on Postsecondary Education/University of Rhode Island and Phi Sigma Delta Alumni Association.

General Counsel Louis Saccoccio gave the presentation.

The University of Rhode Island is bringing a negotiated Uniform Real Estate License Agreement between the Council on Postsecondary Education/University of Rhode Island and Phi Sigma Delta Alumni Association of the University of Rhode Island for the Council's review and approval. This agreement is in support of the Alumni Association's refinancing of their existing loan in the amount of \$1,250,000.

On a motion duly made by Mr. DelGiudice and seconded by Mr. Duffy, it was

VOTED: THAT The Council on Postsecondary Education approve the Uniform Real Estate License Agreement, Licensor's

Consent, Estoppel Certificate, Nondisturbance and Subordination Agreement between the Council on Postsecondary Education/URI and Phi Sigma Delta Alumni Association, as presented.

VOTE: 9 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator Thomas Izzo and Dr. Jeffery Williams.

NAYS: 0

ABSTAINS: 0

c) Approval of Amendments to Parking Policy URI, RIC and CCRI

Steven Baker, Director of Public Safety, Chief of Police, at the University of Rhode Island gave the presentation on the amendments to the parking policies.

On May 18, 2016, the heads of public safety at the University of Rhode Island, Rhode Island College, and the Community College of Rhode Island met with Chief Justice William Guglietta of the Rhode Island Traffic Tribunal (RITT) to discuss updating the parking policies/regulations and procedures across the three campuses. Following the meeting, changes were proposed to the current policies/regulations that would allow the institutions to issue citations for parking in reserved spaces or using fraudulent permits. Also, under the new amended policies/regulations, URI would be able to issue internal citations for first offenses for non-registration or non-display, and URI is requesting that the Council set fines of \$50 and \$20, respectively, for those offenses.

These proposed amendments to the system-wide parking policies/regulations were discussed at the Council Special Meeting on August 10, 2016, with the intention of implementing changes in January. During the discussion, a question arose as to consequences for outstanding parking tickets, and assurances were given that unpaid parking tickets would not prevent students from enrolling or registering.

Chair Cottam asked how the students are informed of the ticketing policy. Chief Baker answered that it is on their website, and that parents are notified of this at orientation.

On a motion duly made by Mr. DelGiudice and seconded by Dr. Williams, it was

VOTED: THAT The Council on Postsecondary Education approve the amendments to the system-wide parking regulations and fines, as presented.

VOTE: 9 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy, William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator Thomas Izzo and Dr. Jeffery Williams.

NAYS: 0

ABSTAINS: 0

7. Synthesis and Discussion regarding Items 2 and 3.

The Council members stated that it was a very informative day.

Chair Foulkes thanked everyone for attending.

8. ADJOURNMENT

On a motion duly made by Mr. Duffy and seconded by Mr. DelGiudice, it was:

VOTED: THAT The Council on Postsecondary Education adjourn the meeting of September 23, 2016.

VOTE: 9 members voted in the affirmative and 0 members voted in the negative as follows:

YEAS: Michael Bernstein, Barbara Cottam, Heather

Crosby, Timothy DelGiudice, Dennis Duffy,
William Foulkes, Rachelle Green, Senator
Thomas Izzo and Dr. Jeffery Williams.

NAYS: 0

ABSTAINS: 0

The meeting adjourned at 3:20 p.m.